

## Letter from Alexander Graham Bell to Mabel Hubbard Bell, October 3, 1902

Letter of Trans miss al Beinn Bhreagh Victoria County, Cape Breton, N.S. October 3, 1902.

Dear Mabel: —

You will see from the enclosed VOLUME that I have taken a great deal of trouble to get at the facts of the case in the difficulty between Mr. Davidson and the Manager in an honest effort to reach a just decision. I now submit the whole matter to you for your approval.

The Volume consists of three parts: — Part I, contains statements of facts relating to the matter and constitutes the evidence collected; Part II contains my discussion of the evidence; Part III, the decision at which I have arrived in the form of a letter to be sent to Mr. McInnis with a copy to Mr. Davidson.

I do not propose to submit Parts I and II to either of the men. They are simply for our own information and for discussion between ourselves. If you approve of my decision send the letters to Mr. McInnis and Mr. Davidson, and use your best endeavors to have Mr. Davidson apologize.

After looking over the whole matter — and especially after reading Mr. Davidson's letters to you — I am of the opinion that a real reconciliation between the two men is impracticable and therefore will not attempt to bring it about. But the authority of our Manager must be maintained by us, and this means that an apology must be made. I think that if you bring your influence with Mr. Davidson to bear upon this point, you can secure an apology that will satisfy Mr. McInnis, and the equities of the case and thus lead to temporary peace.

## Library of Congress

When this has been attained, we can make arrangements to avoid friction between the two men, by not placing one under the other. We can make some such arrangement as I made with John McKillop. It would never do to do this now, as it would seem to be a reflection upon Mr. McInnis, who appears to me to have acted in this whole matter with great forbearance and propriety. We must sustain him now, and this demands an apology from Mr. Davidson. If this can be brought about I think your desire to retain Mr. Davidson may then be fulfilled.

Without an apology from him we shall lose Mr. McInnis, who cannot afford to remain with us unless we maintain and support him in all proper exercise of his powers as Manager.

Now, do look into this matter carefully and don't allow your sympathies to sway your judgment too much. I sympathize too with Mr. Davidson, but I can see very clearly that he must either go in disgrace or apologize.

Your loving husband Alec. Mrs. Alexander Graham Bell, Beinn Bhreagh, Baddeck, N. S.

### **PART I The Evidence. STATEMENTS OF FACTS RELATING TO THE DIFFICULTY BETWEEN THE GARDENER AND THE MANAGER SEPTEMBER 20, 1902.**

#### **EVIDENCE COLLECTED**

##### Pages

Statement of Evidence, Sept. 26 1 – 4

Supplementary from Mrs. Bell, Sept. 30 5 – 7

Supplementary from Mr. Davidson 7 – 9

Supplementary from Mr. McInnis 10 – 12

## Library of Congress

Supplementary Points from Mr. Davidson's letters Mrs. Bell 13 – 14

Copy of Correspondence between Mr. Davidson and Mrs. Bell 15 – 28

1

**5 sent write letter to Mr. Davidson 1902 Sept 26 STATEMENT**

**Tuesday , Sept . 16 , 1902**

Having to leave very suddenly for the States to see an old friend who was dying I asked my Secretary to notify the Manager of Beinn Bhreagh that I wished to have a piece of ground leveled before I returned, so that it might be all ready for the erection of a structure — a windbreak — which I proposed to place upon it the moment I returned. The following letter was sent to the Manager in accordance with these instruction: —

**FROM MR. BELL'S PRIVATE SECRETARY TO THE MANAGER OF B.B.**

“September 16, 1902 Mr. Angus McInnis, Manager Beinn Bhreagh Dear Mr. McInnis: —

Mr. Bell asked me to write to you about preparing the ground for the windbreak. He has staked out the place on the field, and wants to have it made more nearly level than it is now. He would like to have the earth taken from the upper part and put on the lower part, and especially he would like to have the sod preserved and put back again. He has told Mr. Ferguson all about it, and suggests that you talk the matter over with him. Dr. Bell is very anxious to have this done right away.

Most sincerely yours, Jean Safford, Secretary”.

The Manager being in camp at the time did not receive the letter until next day: —

2

**5 2 Wednesday, September 17, 1902.**

## Library of Congress

Mr. McInnis received the above letter and immediately tried to get someone outside of Beinn Bhreagh to contract to do the work.

### **Thursday, September 18, 1902**

On Thursday evening Mr. McInnis reported to Mrs. Bell through my secretary that he could not get horses off the place to do the work, and did not like to take the farm horses on Beinn Bhreagh from their work of taking in the grain, so that the ground for the windbreak had not been broken. He stated that he was unwilling to take the horses used by the family for driving without special permission from Mrs. Bell; but that if she was willing the horses "Dewey" and "Alpha" could be put upon the work. Mrs. Bell replied that "Dewey" or "Alpha" or any of the other horses on the place might be used as it was more important to have Mr. Bell's work go on than anything else. This decision was telephoned to the Manager the same evening by my Private Secretary Miss Safford.

### **Friday, September 19, 1902.**

My Manager Mr. McInnis started on the work of breaking up the ground for the windbreak, Friday morning, using the horses "Dewey" and "Alpha", and doing a good deal of the work personally himself on account of the scarcity of men. Mrs. Bell was so anxious about the matter that she went down before breakfast to the laboratory to be sure that the work was going on, and was pleased to find the Manager and one or two other men engaged in plowing up the land with "Dewey" and "Alpha" in the plow. These horses were kept at work all that day. The Manager, however, finding that the ground 3 5 3 was very stiff to work decided that it would be better to use the farm horses as much as possible, and thus save the carriage horses "Dewey" and the "Alpha".. He therefore with Mrs. Bell's consent and approval ( gave instructions that the farm horses should be used next day and that "Dewey" and "Alpha" should do their work of taking in the grain. The grain would not be ready for removal until the early afternoon, but he thought it important that it should be

## Library of Congress

placed under cover the same day as it would otherwise have to remain in the field exposed to the weather over Sunday.

### **Saturday Sept 20**

The Manager notified Mr. McKinnon, who has charge of the carriage horses, that "Dewey" and "Alpha" would be needed early Saturday afternoon for this work.

Notification given Sat. Morning see supplementary & Mr. AGB

### Saturday, September 20.

Two farm horses were put on the work of grading the ground for the windbreak, and kept at it all day. In the afternoon Dougal MacDonald, who was putting in the grain, reported to the Manager that though "Dewey" was in the stable "Alpha" had been sent up to the Point to work for the Gardener, Mr. Davidson, and that he could not get on without two horses.

Enquiry developed the fact that the Gardener had during the course of the day, sent Willie Morrison down to the stable for the horse "Alpha" to do his work at the Point, and that the Coachman, (Mr. McKinnon) told Willie Morrison that the Manager had left instructions that he wanted "Alpha" in the afternoon. Willie Morrison telephoned this to the Gardener, who was reported to have telephoned back to bring up "Alpha" right away to the Point, notwithstanding the instructions left by the Manager. This was done, and Willie Morrison took "Alpha" up to the Point.

4

5 4 Mr. McInnis the Manager finding that Alpha was not in the stable when wanted, sent Dougal MacDonald up to the Point with the following note for the Gardener, Mr. Davidson:

—

"Dear Mr. Davidson: —

## Library of Congress

Will you please give “Alpha” to Dougal to put in oats — and please save trouble.

Yours, Angus McInnis.”

The Gardener sent Dougal MacDonald back to the Manager returning his note with the following answer written upon the back: —

“Mr. McInnis: —

No. Alpha is at work here and you have got plenty horses and my work is as important as yours. You seem to be in for trouble all the time.

J.G.Davidson”.

The horse “Alpha” was ultimately sent down — I believe at the personal request of Mrs. Bell — but at so late an hour that only one load of grain was taken in, the rest having to lie in the field over Sunday.

In the evening the Gardener passed by the Manager's office, and Mr. McInnis called out “Good evening” to him. Mr. Davidson passed by without taking any notice of him until half way between the office and warehouse, when he stopped, turned round and insulted Mr. McInnis.

I do not care to put down here what Mr. Davidson is reported to have said, or what Mr. McInnis may have replied. Both Mr. Davidson and Mr. McInnis were excited and angry, and I have no doubt both said a great deal that they must have regretted since; and I have no doubt that both will be glad to take back unconsidered words that were said in the heat of the moment. I will not therefore repeat them: — These are the facts so far as developed. I still have to hear from the Gardener, Mr. Davidson, and from Mrs. Bell. AGB

**190 2, Sept. 30 Tuesday At Beinn Bhreagh SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES By Mrs. Bell.**

**Thursday, Sept. 18, 1902.**

On Thursday or earlier Mrs. Bell directed Mr. Davidson's attention to the condition of the grass on the lawn, and suggested that it was about time to have it mowed.

She gave Mr. McInnis permission to use Dewey or Alpha or any of the other horses on the place as it was more important to have Mr. Bell's work go on than anything else, and Miss Safford telephoned this to the Manager.

**Friday, Sept. 19, 1902.**

Mrs. Bell went down to the Laboratory before breakfast to be sure that the work on the foundation of the windbreak was going on. Mr. McInnis told her then that the ground was very stiff to work and said he thought it would be better to use the farm horses next day for this work and let Dewey and Alpha take in the grain in their stead. Mrs. Bell gave her permission to do this.

**Saturday, Sept. 20.**

When Dougall MacDonald went up to the Point with a note to Mr. Davidson from Mr. McInnis, he also brought a note from Mr. McInnis to Mrs. Bell. He delivered the note to Mrs. Bell first and then delivered the note to Mr. Davidson. Mrs. Bell has not preserved the note, but remembers the substance of it, which was somewhat as follows: —

6

**2 FROM THE MANAGER TO MRS. GRAHAM BELL**

“Dear Mrs. Bell: —

## Library of Congress

Which would you rather that Mr. Bell's work should be stopped or the oats not put in. Davidson has Alpha by force. If McKinnon and Davidson are to run the place it's time I went. I am tired of all this wrangling. Sorry to trouble you.

Yours sincerely, Angus McInnis”.

Mrs. Bell either wrote or telephoned to Mr. McInnis asking why the horse MacKinlay could not be used for the oats with Dewey. She thinks she wrote this and sent it by Dougall MacDonald, but is not sure. At all events the telephone message came back that Mr. McInnis thought the work too rough for MacKinlay. Upon receipt of this Mrs. Bell went out and spoke to Mr. Davidson. She explained to Mr. Davidson that she had told Mr. McInnis that he could have all the horses if necessary as Mr. Bell's work was the most important thing on the place. Mrs. Bell cannot recall the details of the conversation.

Mrs. Bell has written out the following memorandum relating to the conversation she had with Mr. Davidson after he had received the note from Mr. McInnis through Dougal MacDonald: —

Mrs. Bell says: —

“Mr. Davidson was evidently fearfully excited and trembling. He said there were plenty of horses in the stable as good as Alpha, but that Mr. McInnis wanted to interfere with his work and keep him back. That his work was all planned out before hand and arranged for and he got it done — but Mr. McInnis was never before hand with his and was always calling on him to help out his own deficiencies. That there was Gyp — Mr. McInnis's horse — in the stable doing nothing, and was quite as well able to do the work as Alpha — but he wanted to take Mr. Davidson's horse away. Finally, he said that any horse would do for him — if MacKinlay was sent down he was quite willing to give up Alpha.

3 The idea seemed to be that Mr. McInnis was simply using Mr. Bell's work as a pretext for taking a horse from him when there were others that would do as well. Therefore he refused to give him up”.

**SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES By Mr. Davidson.**

In reply to my note of September 26th, 1902, requesting a statement from Mr. Davidson in writing, I received the following note and enclosure.

“Beinn Bhreagh, Sept. 26, 1902. Dear Mr. Bell: —

In reference to your letter of date — Yes — the note between Mr. McInnis and I is perfectly right just as it happened.

When I sent down for the horse Willie met Mr. McKinnon on the way and he said Mr. McInnis said Davidson would not get the horse to the Point today, but gave no reason. This occurred about 10 A. M. Willie telephoned to me what was said and I asked what was the reason. He said no reason given. Then I said to bring Alpha up, which he did, and we worked her the rest of the forenoon and in the afternoon both. About 3 P. M. Mr. McInnis sent up this note. I was then very busy mowing and as I knew other horses were on the place and asked Dougall MacDonald if the mare that had the colt was working, he said no. I then wrote the note.

I understand since that Mr. McKinnon said to Mr. McInnis that he understood from him (Mr. McInnis) when he came here that Alpha was for the Gardener's work, and that he then told Mr. McInnis that he wanted straight work or none at all. This was when he saw Mr. McInnis in such a contemptible against me. I don't know how this ended, as I made no enquiry.

As regards not speaking at the office. I said good evening, same as Mr. McInnis, and then said I was going to report to Mr. Bell all this trouble about the horse today — that I had a letter that a horse was to put aside for my work and that I was certainly entitled to a reason

## Library of Congress

for ordering her kept in the barn in the morning, and of course this led on to a more heated discussion.

This morning Willie Morrison turned over a letter to me from Mr. McInnis which I enclose, and which the boy asks me whose orders he is to work by after this, I am unable to give the desired information. And if this order is to be 8 4 carried out regardless of the standing order that now exists in writing and your verbal word to me last fall the result will be no end of trouble about horse.

Yours truly, John G. Davidson”.

Enclosure. Letter from Manager to Assistant Gardener.

“Beinn Bhreagh, Sept. 24, 1902. Dear Willie: —

I want you to be very careful after this not to take a horse or anything without first asking me for it — there has been already trouble on that account. I will be only too willing to let a horse or anything else to the Point when available — but I will not have anyone outside of Mr. and Mrs. Bell to take anything without asking for it. You have taken Alpha the other day after McKinnon telling you I was going to use her in the afternoon. This must not occur again.

Yours truly, Angus McInnis, Manager.”

In his note of the 26th inst. Mr. Davidson says:

“I had a letter that a horse was to be put aside for my work and that I was certainly entitled to a reason for ordering her kept in the barn in the morning”.

I have just written to Mr. Davidson (Sept. 30) asking him to let me see the letter, and telling him that I am going over the whole matter with Mrs. Bell.

## Library of Congress

The letter turns out to be a note from Mrs. Bell written last year, dated September 26, and the passage referring to the horse reads as follows: —

“When we are not here one of the horses will be set apart for your special use, when we are here arrangements can be made so that there shall not be so much interference with your work as was the case last summer”.

9

5 This letter was typewritten by Mrs. Bell herself and was apparently sent without keeping any copy of it, at least it does not appear in the letter press copy book. What Mr. Davidson has sent me appears to be only a portion of the letter — one page without any signature. I think we better copy it here: —

“Beinn Bhreagh, September 26” (1901) “Dear Mr. Davidson: —

Mr. Bell and I are pleased with what you have done, and the things which you ask for seem reasonable and proper for you to have. Will you please consult with Mr. McInnis as to how you can best obtain them, and let me know.

Mr. Bell thinks that a cart should be kept here for garden use and a shelter provided for it. When we are not here one of the horses will be set apart for your special use, when we are here arrangements can be made so that there shall not be so much interference with your work as was the case last summer. What you ask for is: —

More water. This Mr. Bell is trying to provide for now

2. Tool house Price ?

3. Horse and cart Price of cart?

4 Cultivator \$12.00

## Library of Congress

5. Light one-horse plough 8.00

6. Cast iron lawn roller 15.00

7. Fitting stone-roller for horse power.?"

The rest of the letter is not enclosed by Mr. Davidson. AGB

10

**1902, October 1 Wednesday At Beinn Bhreagh SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES By Mr. McInnis.**

In answer to my note of yesterday, (September 30) Mr. McInnis says: —

"I had no conversation with McKinnon except telling him I was to use Alpha in the afternoon. Willie's letter will explain that. I didn't know Mr. Davidson was to take Alpha that day. I called in the stable on my way to the Laboratory and told Mr. McKinnon as above."

This evidently means that the instructions were given to McKinnon on Saturday instead of the preceding evening, for he was on the way to the Laboratory and simply called in to the stables to tell McKinnon that he wanted the horse in the afternoon. In reference to having some communication with Mrs. Bell, Mr. McInnis gives me the following note she wrote to him: —

"Dear Mr. McInnis: —

I don't see why MacKinlay shouldn't be used. He seems to be standing in the stable while Alpha is at work. I have telephoned McKinnon to put MacKinlay with Dewey — and he is going to do it. Of course Mr. Bell's work is the most important.

Yours sincerely M. G. Bell"

(This letter though undated was written on Saturday afternoon September 20, as appears from the evidence in other places).

Mr. McInnis telephoned to Mrs. Bell that he would not like to use MacKinlay in the truck, as the place was so rough and steep.

Mr. McInnis encloses a letter from Willie D. Morrison, dated September 26, in reply to Mr. McInnis's note of September 24, given in Supplementary Notes by Mr. Davidson, p. 4. Following is the reply: —

11

### **2 FROM THE ASSISTANT GARDENER TO THE MANAGER**

“Beinn Bhreagh, Sept. 26, 1902. Mr. McInnis: —

I don't think you can blame me for taking Alpha to the point the other day. I was sent down for her. MacKinnon told me your orders, so I telephoned to the Point and told Davidson your orders. He ordered the mare right down to work. I am here to do as I am told, which I will do as long as I am here, so I don't think I was any cause of all this trouble

Willie D. Morrison”.

One other point I think not noted. Mr. McInnis had no conversation or communication whatever with Mr. Davidson before he sent him the note asking for the horse, so that there was no opportunity for anything to pass between the two men that might have tended to irritate Davidson. (Got this from Mr. McInnis at his office)

It should be noted in this connection that no instructions were given by Mr. McInnis to Davidson or Willie Morrison. The instructions were given to the coachman McKinnon, so that it was really he who disobeyed the instructions by allowing the horse in his charge to go out of the stable when ordered by the Manager to keep it there for his use. It

seems therefore that McKinnon should be examined to find out why he let the horse go. I presume that he would shuffle off the responsibility onto the shoulders of Willie Morrison, and say that Willie Morrison took it — and 12 3 Willie Morrison would in turn shuffle off the responsibility from his shoulders by saying that Mr. Davidson told him to take her, and that he was under instructions to obey Mr. Davidson, so that the ultimate result would be to fix the responsibility upon Mr. Davidson, where, of course, it really belongs. I am disinclined to stir up matters by bringing other people into the matter and will try to get along without examining Mr. McKinnon or Willie Morrison. Mr. McInnis has made no complaint against them, and I can therefore afford to let them go. Besides, it is the Manager's duty to manage the men. That is what he is for, and it is not for me to interfere unless called upon by the Manager for help. It is only then with the relations between Mr. Davidson and Mr. McInnis that I am called upon to deal. Now, I think, I have all the necessary facts before me, and will consider the evidence closed.

I append to these notes a copy of the correspondence between Mr. Davidson and Mrs. Bell. This completes the case. AGB

13

### **SUPPLEMENTARY POINTS FROM MR DAVIDSON'S LETTERS TO MRS. BELL ABOUT THE MATTER**

Mr. Davidson's note of September 20 was written on the day of the occurrence, and reveals his state of mind and the facts of the case as he understood them. It is discursive and abusive of Mr. McInnis, and it is necessary in order to realize exactly what happened to eliminate everything of a discursive nature. I therefore make the following quotations of the points that deal with the facts or the supposed facts in the case.

### **EXTRACTS FROM MR. DAVIDSON'S LETTERS TO MRS. BELL.**

(From note of Sept. 20)

## Library of Congress

"In regard to trouble this afternoon about horses \* \* \* there was no reason for any such occurrence as there are horses enough on Beinn Bhreagh to tend to all the work done just now if properly conducted, and a little less spite and more common sense on Mr. McInnis part would have avoided any trouble. The previous night" (Friday Sept. 19) "I said to Mr. McKinnon if he should be coming to the Point Saturday morning about 10 o'clock I asked if he would bring Alpha up for me, as I was to be mowing as soon as the grass would dry. Mr. McKinnon said there was some talk of going to camp and that Mrs. Bell might require Alpha. I said all right, he would know in the morning, and that any of the other horses would do with me for mowing. When Mr. McKinnon went to harness Alpha to take her up for me Mr. McInnis said let her remain in the barn that Davidson would not get her today. Before I knew anything of this I had sent Willie down for the mare and he telephoned up that McInnis said I could not have her. I asked the reason but there was no reason given. When the mare is there to do my work I consider I am entitled to take her unless some reason is given to keep her in the house, and it was not until after 3 o'clock Mr. McInnis mentioned oats. All this could have been avoided had Mr. McInnis had a smooth disposition and come to the telephone and explained matters."

Here the letter becomes discursive in order to support Mr. Davidson's idea "that anything in connection with the garden and gardener it is Mr. McInnis' disposition to keep them back". 14 2 He refers to various incidents of the past and uses language in characterizing Mr. McInnis that is utterly indefensible. (See letter), but as it is all apart from the case I am considering I omit it here, so as to have before me what he said about the present case alone.

### **FROM LETTER DATED SEPT. 21.**

This was written in reply to Mrs. Bell's of Sept. 20. There is very little in it bearing upon the case. The letter shows him to be in a better frame of mind, and more reasonable —

“About the horse, you know that last fall a horse was to be put aside for my work, had it not been so I would not have been here today, as I know I cannot get along without a horse, and if every horse in the barn had worked as well for their feed as Alpha during the past nine months there would be no loss in keeping horses, and when I send for her I expect to find her in the barn ready for work, unless some reason is given otherwise, if everyone was to take her out to work it would only be a constant trouble. \* \* \* \* \*

\* \* \* Furthermore I understand while you are here if you require Alpha for driving she has to do that work even if I did require her.\* And when Mr. McKinnon came here he said he was to take Alpha into his barn and feed her as she was not getting proper attention. I told Mr. McKinnon then that Alpha had to do driving as well as my work while the family was here, and if Mr. McKinnon knows of anything she will be required for he notifies me before hand so as I know not to send for her therefore we avoid trouble. In regard to Mr. McInnis as general manager, I have always looked on him as such, but I think as a rule general managers enforce their orders in a more aimable way.” &c.

The rest of the letter is discursive.

The following are the letters in full that passed between Mr. Davidson and Mrs. Bell: —  
A.G.B. A. G. B.

**COPY OF CORRESPONDENCE BETWEEN MRS. BELL AND MR. DAVIDSON.**

15

Beinn Bhreagh, September 20, 1902. Dear Mrs. Bell: —

In regard to trouble this afternoon about horses, I am very sorry you should have been molested in anyway about anything of the kind as it makes it very unpleasant for you as well as those concerned, and there was no reason for any such occurrence as there are horses enough on Beinn Bhreagh to tend to all the work done just now if properly conducted, and a little less spite and more common sense on Mr. McInnis's part would

## Library of Congress

have avoided any trouble. The previous night I said to Mr. McKinnon if he should be coming to the point Saturday morning about 10 o'clock I asked if he would bring Alpha up for me, as I was to be mowing as soon as the grass would dry. Mr. McKinnon said there was some talk of going to camp and that Mrs. Bell might require Alpha. I said all right he would know in the morning, and that any of the other horses would do with me for mowing. When Mr. McKinnon went to harness Alpha to take her up for me Mr. McInnis said let her remain in the barn that Davidson would not get her today. Before I knew anything of this I had sent Willie down for the mare and he telephoned up that McInnis said I could not have. I asked the reason but there was no reason given. When the mare is there to do my work I consider I am entitled to take her unless some reason is given to keep her in the house and it was not until after three o'clock Mr. McInnis mentioned oats. All this could have been avoided had Mr. McInnis had a smooth disposition and come to the telephone and explained matters. But it seems to me and I have good proof of it that anything in connection 16 2 with the Garden and Gardener it is Mr. McInnis disposition to keep them back, not only with me but men that has served the position before me. It is only too well known by the general public. Anything done at this end to improve appearances Mr. McInnis is against. Take the sheep at the point. When I told him Mr. Bell wanted them there this was all wrong (I differ). Take the terrace. All this was to spoil the look of the place and he was against the work going on all the time and he kept snarling at me all the time, until one day I could put up with it no longer and I said: Mr. McInnis, you and I are here to carry out Mr. and Mrs. Bell's wishes, and Mrs. Bell wishes this work done, and I ask you for the necessary men and horse to do the work. I had no more trouble until Spring again. I then told Mr. McInnis should Mrs. Bell decide to make any alteration on the terrace that it would be done different to what it was that I would have no more fooling with men and horses withdrawing them at all times costing double the amount it ought to. And as you are aware when you decided to make the alterations, I then asked you to write Mr. McInnis about the horses. Again the same disagreeable snarling commenced. I then told Mr. McInnis I would put up with this no longer to take the men and horses away and the work would cease until your return. This settled that point, I heard no more of it

## Library of Congress

until July 29th when I had an extra man helping forward the work after the delay of the Terrace, and he was working in the nursery and Mr. McInnis took him away and left the work undone, and did not even let me know he did so. I was waiting for him to report being done, so I could go down with the plow and finish up, and when I went down I found the work undone. I said to Mr. McInnis he might have let me know 17 3 3 he took the man away. He told me I was after trouble and that I had better look out or he would do so and so. Mr. McKinnon was beside and heard all I said and what Mr. McInnis said and remarked I had a cool head when I did not strike Mr. McInnis, but I have travelled through this world so far without a fighting or dishonest stain on my character, and I don't propose to stain it here through ignorance. All of this is very annoying to any one trying to get work forwarded in quietness.

For the short time I have been in the country I have made many friends in Baddeck and elsewhere, although I have not had much opportunity to go around much, and how is it the general public keep asking me how I get along with McInnis and tell me I am the first man they ever knew get along so well with him. I can get along with anyone that there is reason and common sense in, but I have had more trouble in the execution of my duties to my employer since I came here than ever I had since I commenced to work for myself, and Mr. McInnis cannot tell me anything about my work and he knows it, therefore he don't try to. But Mr. McInnis has got to understand he can't abuse me as he does other men on the place. I have seen and heard men get more abused since I came here than ever I heard in my life. What is the result, men have no respect for anyone who would use them as he does.

One thing I consider very poor judgment on Mr. McInnis part. Some time in June you called me in and said Mr. Bell and you had decided to advance my wages \$10 per month, which I appreciated very much, and I told Mr. McInnis of it at the time I have been paid June, July and August with no advance. If Mr. McInnis had 18 4 4 any reason to misdoubt my word it was only a matter of writing you a note, but instead of doing so he had to remark among his men that Davidson said he was getting \$10 advance but that he had

## Library of Congress

heard no word and would pay me the usual and let me kick. When I heard the remark I said it was only an overlook of yours as you were busy at the time and had not notified Mr. McInnis but that I would remind you of it. I think he ought to guard his tongue as men will turn over such remarks when spoken in such a slighting way. I am sorry to take up your time on report of my fellow workman, but I consider my character my bread earner, therefore I have to clear myself.

Sincerely yours, (Signed) John G. Davidson.

19

This letter crossed Mr. Davidson's letter and was not of the same date and was not an answer to it. 5 Beinn Bhreagh, September 20, 1902. Dear Mr. Davidson: —

I was very sorry for the trouble about the horses this afternoon. I am afraid that you have your own troubles and that some times you find it very hard to get on.

I can understand how very annoying it must be to you to have your work interfered with when you have planned it out carefully. We all of us appreciate the faithfulness and conscientiousness with which you have worked, and are more pleased than we know how to say with the results of that work. We believe that in time you could bring your work up to the level of any in the country, and that you have the opportunity of making a name and position for yourself here as your countryman — my mother's gardener — has for himself in Washington.

All your work is a delight to me and to Mr. Bell, who is growing more and more interested in it — and I am always ready to help you to get things as right as possible.

At the same time you are yourself too capable a man — too good an overseer not to realize fully that there can be but one general manager on this place, and that he must be able to enforce his orders or cease to be the manager.

## Library of Congress

I am very much mistaken in you if you would allow any man working under your direction to dispute any order you might give. I should be very sorry for the man who tried to!

I wonder whether you realize what a hard time Mr. McInnis has in many ways. You have been allowed to work comparatively undisturbed by Mr. Bell and me, but as General Manager Mr. McInnis 20 6 2 is called on constantly to do unexoected things for which it is impossible for him to have prepared before.

Take this windbreak of Mr. Bell's for example, which has been the cause of the trouble about the horses this afternoon. Mr. McInnis could not have prepared for it beforehand for Mr. Bell himself did not decide on it until lately. When he did he simply gave Mr. McInnis preemptory orders that the thing must be done at once without delay no matter what other thing on the place suffered. Mr. McInnis had just returned from camp where he was carrying out another unexpected preemptory order — Meantime his grain was ready to reap and he knew that if that grain was spoilt both Mr. Bell and I would be annoyed by and by when we had to pay the bills for oats necessary to replace the loss. He went all over the country trying to get horses and men, but everybody else is at their busiest now and he could find nothing. There was nothing for him to do but to go ahead and fill Mr. Bell's order the best way he knew how, and try to save as much of the grain as he could. Very likely he made some mistakes — very possibly he might have managed better about the horses in some way, but he had only two days in which to do a piece of work which should require several — and he knew Mr. Bell depended on him to have the work done — that he would accept no excuse — that he would expect Mr. McInnis to put every horse and every man on the job if necessary. I think that with such a job coming on top of the camp one, with his grain worrying him, Mr. McInnis might be excused if he showed less consideration, was more preemptory than he should have been. I am sure I should have been in his place. I know that he takes great pride and pleasure in your work and means to help you all he can. Knowing as I do what 21 7 3 went on before you came — I can see how little you have been interfered with. Mr. McInnis has called on his own men to fill sudden orders

## Library of Congress

of ours rather than disturb you — and the consequence has been that the work under his immediate supervision is much less forward than yours and suffers in comparison. I know that he feels badly about this — but in a great measure the fault lies not with him but with us — Mr. Bell and I — Mr. and Mrs. Grosvenor. We come here — Mr. Bell to carry on his experiments — and this is the chief object and reason of our residence here — the rest of us for pleasure and rest after the winter's work — and we have in the twelve or thirteen years Mr. McInnis has been with us — educated him to feel that the gratitude of our immediate wishes is his first duty, and he has tried his best to do it — no matter what else suffered — or at what cost of health and strength to himself.

I want you to feel that although Your and Mr. McInnis' way of doing things may not always be the same — yet he is actuated by the same high sense of duty as you — and means to do the best he can in the face of many difficulties — just as you do — Also that Mr. Bell and I have a very high regard for and confidence in you both — and that it is our earnest wish that in spite of occasional differences of opinion you may both remain long with us.

Sincerely yours, (Signed) M. G. Bell.

22

8 Beinn Bhreagh, September 21, 1902. Dear Mrs. Bell: —

Yours of 20th duly received, and I appreciate very highly the congratulating remarks you make about my work and the place. I am only sorry I cannot make more progress in getting the surroundings kept in better shape than we do. You mention about my work not being interfered with, but you must consider the amount of ground we have to cover here and only two men to do it, and bear in mind gardening work is what takes up time and we have to work hard day after day and when night comes it is hard at times to show in appearance what has been done. As I told Mr. McInnis when I came here that it would take 6 men to keep this place in anything like shape, and my agreement was then that I was to be unmolested I or my man at my work, the appearance of the place then was, you

## Library of Congress

could scarcely twill the driveway from the lawns. When I saw the condition of the place I said I had better return the way I came as one man's work would never be seen on the place. It was then agreed I would have a man all the time, and of course when you don't wish for further expense I have tried my best to make some show to have the place tidy, so far in my eyesight I have failed. Take for instance vegetable growing alone many a place in the states where there are only 4 or 5 of a family a man has nothing else to do but attend to growing vegetables in season, and he can only bring them in rotation same as I am doing here and even then often get left in a crop through bad seed, &c. But I consider it a great pleasure to supply the different houses, as it is just as easy to put in for 20 as for two when we have the ground to go over anyway, 23 9 2 only sorry we don't have a home market in Baddeck that I could turn something out of vegetables. Had I not a good willing boy as I am happy to say I have, altho he has no understanding of carrying on work he is very willing to do as instructed, and we go hand in hand and in harmony with our work, therefore I can get double the work done by using the boy right than I could if worrying him all the time, and if we had to run all over the estate and work at everything where would our gardening go. I know what a man should do in a day, and how to get the most done too, and I have to allow considerable for a man that has never seen any gardening work done, besides a man that has travelled and seen how things were done even if he had not worked at it, it makes a difference if one has seen it. In speaking of unexpected work, it is only them that is in the gardening work that can realize what that is. I have not seen the day yet that my work has been forward. It is always behind, I only wish at times I had four hands instead of two to make the work that it would not be such a eyesore when I see things neglected. I can realize Mr. McInnis position very well, but it is one thing to plan work and have men to do it, and another thing to plan and accomplish the work both. The trouble is Mr. McInnis don't realize my position, had he at any time to have done the work himself he would then realize the time it takes to accomplish little, and he might have had a better idea what is required to do the work and what every hour in the day means in getting work done. If Mr. McInnis knew what a man should accomplish in a day there would be less friction with men on Beinn Bhreagh than what is. In regard to your

## Library of Congress

immediate wishes I did not consider I had to be educated on that point as I was brought up from infancy that when I went out in the world to work for myself I had to carry out my 24 10 3 employer's wishes at all times if reasonable, therefore I consider myself in that position today.

About the horse, you know that last fall a horse was to be put aside for my work, had it not been so I would not have been here today, as I know I cannot get along without a horse, and if every horse in the barn had worked as well for their feed as Alpha during the past nine months there would be no loss in keeping horses, and when I send for her I expect to find her in the barn ready for work unless some reason is given otherwise, if everyone was to take her out to work it would only be a constant trouble. The only regret I have is I have not the time to use her so much as I should like to for the benefit of the place; furthermore I understand while you are here if you require Alpha for driving she has to do that work even if I did require her. And when Mr. McKinnon came here he said he was to take Alpha into his barn and feed her as she was not getting proper attention. I told Mr. McKinnon then that Alpha had to do driving as well as my work while the family was here, and if Mr. McKinnon knows of anything she will be required for he notifies me before hand so as I know not to send for her therefore we avoid trouble. In regard to Mr. McInnis as general manager, I have always looked on him as such, but I think as a rule General Managers enforce their orders in a more aimable way, even as G. Manager that is not to say if I am placed here to look after the place for your interest Mr. McInnis is to come here to carry anything out of the garden or take any of my tools away or take my man away from work I have sent him to do without notifying me. I say no, I am here to look after your interest and your interest is mine, at least it has always been my point to be dutiful to my 25 11 4 employer whatever sphere of life I am in, and I have endeavored to be the same here. But Mr. McInnis has asked me to do things here which I considered would be infringing on his rights and I did not hesitate to tell him so, he asked me to hire horses to do the terrace work, I told him that was his work. I think I would have felt very small had I been foolish enough to do so and so many horses on the place when you would get the bill for horse

## Library of Congress

labor on the terrace. I know Mr. McInnis would have said I hired them that he did not know of it — then I would get the call down, but I have a little more foresight than get trapped in that way, and I have repeatedly told Mr. McInnis I did not want to infringe on his rights in any way. I have always found great pleasure in working for Mr. Bell and you in whatever I am called on to do. But at the same time the world is wide and no man need be abused or run on. I know when I am used right and I know how to use men also. Had it not been for Mr. McInnis unpleasantness and disobliging way I expected to have been more settled on Beinn Bhreagh than I am now.

Sincerely yours, (Signed) John G. Davidson.

26

12 Monday, September 22, 1902. Dear Mr. Davidson: —

I will submit your letters to Mr. Bell as soon as I can — but he is so much worried about the backwardness of things in his laboratory that I prefer not to add to his troubles if possible.

There is one point you mention however for which I am to blame. I don't think I ever told Mr. McInnis that I had given you the increase of salary, and the reason for this was that I did not know exactly how to manage it — and I have been called away so many times and it has been so hard to get things done that I let things go.

My understanding of your contract with Mr. McInnis when you first came was that you were to have \$40.00 a month and board. Then when the question of your board came up for the winter Mr. Bell said he would pay you \$60.00 a month and let you board yourself. We understood that this was satisfactory to you — and that you employed Maggie to board you. When we came up here you continued to board here — but I now paid Maggie — and I supposed that all your expenses for board ceased — so that we only had to pay you the additional \$10.00 in your salary of \$40.00 so long as we remained here. So I thought you were at least not losing anything when you continued to receive \$60.00 per month with your board also paid — and I would settle details with you later. The gardener's

## Library of Congress

cottage was built for the gardener's use — and was occupied by Mr. Martin my first man, the understanding being that the basement belonged for me to be used as my laundry. It is of course at your disposal now with that exception — and I should have considered 27 13 2 the proper arrangement would have been for us to pay you \$70.00 and let you hire a housekeeper to look after you. But all this required arrangement and discussion as I wanted to have things satisfactory and comfortable for you, — so as you seemed to be getting along all right as things were — I let them go, but of course I should have told Mr. McInnis this.

Of course if the above is not your understanding of our agreement made last fall, or if you are still paying for your board — I should like to know about it.

Yours sincerely, (Signed) M. G. Bell.

Of course this is not a reply to your letter with the one exception of the increase of salary — which should have been settled before.

I may say that this amount \$70.00 per month with cottage is what my mother pays her gardener — unless she has recently increased it after many years of faithful service — so I thought this ought to be right.

28

14 September 23, 1902. Dear Mr. Davidson: —

I am going to camp rather against my will as Mrs. Grosvenor wants to go and I don't like her going alone.

I have not shown Mr. Bell your letters — and am wondering whether it will be necessary as Mr. McInnis has said nothing.

## Library of Congress

I always dislike troubling Mr. Bell for he never likes listening to complaints and is very apt to take summary measures of one kind or another when he does, and this I am very anxious to avoid.

I know that Mr. McInnis is presumptuous in his manner and that it is often hard to be patient, but indeed I don't think you will lose if you will just do the best you can as in the past and continue to avoid discussion.

Mr. McInnis as you know has had much to try him lately and is not at all well, and these things may make him more irritable — which is hard on those who have dealings with him — but should help them to be more patient with him.

I am sure he thinks highly of your work and does not mean to interfere more than he can help — but he has been accustomed to call men and animals off whenever it seemed to him necessary for our work — but I am sure he does not mean to make it harder for you.

Yours sincerely, (Signed) Mabel G. Bell.

### **PART II DISCUSSION OF THE EVIDENCE By A.G.B.**

#### **DISCUSSION OF THE EVIDENCE By A.G.B.**

On Saturday morning, (September 20, 1902) our Manager, while on his way to the field above the Laboratory to superintend the men who were leveling the ground for my windbreak, dropped in at the stable for a moment to leave word that he would require two of the carriage horses (Dewey and Alpha) that day, so that should any horses be sent for from the stable Dewey and Alpha at all events should be retained and kept at hand ready for his work when he should send for them.

Now, it so happened that that very morning our Gardener, not knowing of the above circumstance, and needing the services of a horse at the Point, for some work of his

## Library of Congress

own, sent his assistant down to the stable to bring up the mare Alpha. When the young man found that this would be running counter to the specific instructions left that morning by the Manager, he was in a dilemma what to do, so he telephoned to the Gardener for instructions. In reply he was ordered to bring the mare right up to the Point notwithstanding the Manager's instructions. The young man did so and in this way the horse Alpha was taken from the stable without the knowledge or consent of the Manager, and in opposition to his express instructions, and no word was sent to the Manager about the matter, which might have enabled him to make other arrangements for his own work.

This work related to the farming operations. Instructions had been given to cut a field of oats, and a man was to be sent down 2 to the stable for the horses Dewey and Alpha when the farm hands were all ready to take in the grain. In the afternoon the man appeared at the stable and found that Alpha was not there, but was up at the Point working for the Gardener. As one horse alone could not do the farm work, the man was in a dilemma, not knowing what to do, and having no authority to get any other horses than Dewey and Alpha. He was therefore obliged to hunt up the Manager in order to get instructions, and found him at a considerable distance away — in the field above the Laboratory. It was then Saturday afternoon. The grain had been cut, and if not taken in that same day would have to lie out in the field over Sunday on account of religious objections to working on the Sabbath day.

Under these circumstances the Manager sent the man up to the Point — a distance of about a mile and a half — with the following note to the Gardener.

“Dear Mr. Davidson: —

Will you please give Alpha to Dougall to put in oats — and please save trouble.

Yours, Angus McInnis.”

## Library of Congress

The Gardener bluntly refused to do so, and sent the man back to the Manager without the horse — again a distance of a mile and a half, with the following note: —

“Mr. McInnis: —

No. Alpha is at work here and you have got plenty horses and my work is as important as yours. You seem in for trouble all the time.

J. G. Davidson”.

3

During all this time the Manager was at work in the field above the Laboratory leveling the ground for the windbreak. He was using the farm horses for this purpose — having arranged with Mrs. Bell that the carriage horses, Dewey and Alpha, might be used for the lighter work of taking in the grain. When he sent the note to the gardener he also wrote to Mrs. Bell letting her know that the Gardener had taken away Alpha “by force” — and asking her whether she would prefer that the work on the windbreak should be stopped or that the grain should lie out over Sunday. The farm horses could be used for either work — but of course they could not be in two places at the same time. Mrs. Bell replied that the windbreak was the more important, so the farm horses were kept at work at the Laboratory. At the same time Mrs. Bell ordered Alpha to be sent down to work with Dewey in taking in the oats, and supplied the Gardener with another horse. So much time, however, had been consumed in making these arrangements that only one load of oats was taken in. The rest being left on the field over Sunday.

On Saturday evening the Gardener and Manager had a wordy encounter over this matter — begun by the Gardener — which so embittered the relations of the two men that the Manager reports that either he or the Gardener will have to leave the place. He asks me to decide.

## Library of Congress

These facts are admitted by both the Manager and the Gardener so that it only remains to consider what excuse the Gardener could possibly offer for so flagrant a disregard of the Manager's orders. 4 and why he should send so discourteous a reply to the perfectly proper and courteous note sent him by the Manager.

I shall pass over without comment the most aggravating circumstance connected with the whole matter — the wordy encounter between the Gardener and Manager, which followed in the evening, and which was commenced by the Gardener, — because I can well understand that men who are angry say many things that they would not allow themselves to utter under other circumstances, and I don't want to judge either men by what they said in the heat of passion.

After a full examination of the matter I have come to the conclusion that the utterly false and wrong mistaken position assumed by the Gardener arose from a misunderstanding upon his part of the nature of the Manager's instructions. I suspected this at the first when he told me , that Willie Morrison told him , that Mr. McKinnon told Willie Morrison , that Mr. McInnis told Mr. McKinnon that “Davidson would not get the horse to the Point today ” but and gave no reason.” (See evidence p. 7). It is never safe to rely upon the accuracy of statements passed verbally from mouth to mouth. They nearly always get twisted in transit. In this case the form of the instructions as understood by Mr. Davidson must have been peculiarly offensive to him because there had been previous friction between the Gardener and Manager, and the Gardener had become imbued with the idea “that anything in connection with the garden and Gardener it is Mr. McInnis' disposition to keep them back”, (Evidence p. 13)

5

He therefore looked upon the retention of Alpha in the stable as a matter intended specially to spite him (see p. 13, also letters to Mrs. Bell, pp. 15–28). He knew that there were a number of other horses upon the place, and that he had been accustomed to get Alpha when he wanted a horse at the Point; indeed he had become so accustomed to this

## Library of Congress

that he felt he had a sort of prescriptive right to Alpha — that Alpha was his horse, as it were — and that the Manager had no right to take away his horse without consulting him and giving him a good reason for it. He claimed that excepting so far as Alpha might be needed by Mrs. Bell and the family for driving purposes Alpha belonged to him and that she had been specially set aside for his work. He therefore didn't see why — with other horses upon the place — the Manager should take his horse when he wanted it himself; unless it was to spite him and embarrass his work. I am sorry that Mr. Davidson should have entertained such a thought concerning the Manager's motives. It is unworthy of him, and shows that in this whole matter he has let his temper outweigh his discretion. It appears from the evidence that, believing that the Manager was actuated by spite against him in telling McKinnon that "Davidson wouldn't get the horse to the Point today", and giving no reason for it, he became so angry against the Manager that he determined to take the horse by force and let the Manager look out for another horse for himself. In other words he was actuated by a spirit of revenge, and it becomes obvious in the evidence that he had decided that he wasn't going to help the Manager out of any trouble that might arise from the absence of Alpha when wanted. This becomes specially obvious when he sent back his discourteous 5 6 note to Mr. McInnis, after he had been told by Mr. McInnis the reason for wanting the horse, (see p. 4)..

Now this whole attitude was very wrong on the Gardener's part and utterly unjustified by the facts. In the first place, it was not the Gardener's business to decide what should be done with all the different horses upon the place. That was the Manager's business. The Manager had decided and had left instructions what should be done with Alpha. If the Gardener was dissatisfied with this arrangement he should have gone to the Manager to have it modified, so that he could either get alpha or some other horse as the Manager might decide. He had no right under any circumstances to take the horse by force, nor was it right for him to embarrass the Manager by not letting him know that the horse he relied upon for certain work had been taken away.

## Library of Congress

But we all have to make allowances for men in an irritable frame of mind. Mr. Davidson — with or without cause — was intensely irritated against Mr. McInnis, and this is the key to his whole conduct — he let his temper outweigh his discretion. In order to do full justice to Mr. Davidson and make all allowances akin for his excited state of mind, I have examined all the circumstances of the case to ascertain whether — as a matter of fact — he had any just ground for irritation in the present case.

Mr. Davidson's irritation arose from the fact that he thought was actuated by spite was during Alpha kept in the barn that Mr. McInnis's instructions were that "Davidson should not get the horse to the Point today". This is shown by the evidence to be a misunderstanding. I am inclined to think, also that there was another misunderstanding, for his note to Mrs. Bell suggests 6 7 the thought that he supposed Mr. McInnis himself was in the stable when Alpha was being harnessed up for his use — that Mr. McInnis knew that Davidson wanted the horse — and that he stopped the harnessing and ordered the horse to remain in the stable stating that Davidson wouldn't get the horse to the Point that day. (See Davidson's note to Mrs. Bell of September 20, p. 13).

It is not perfectly clear in my mind that I have correctly interpreted Mr. Davidson's position on that point, but here is what he says for himself: —

"When Mr. McKinnon went to harness Alpha to take her up for me, Mr. McInnis said let her remain in the barn, that Davidson would not get her today. Before I knew anything of this I had sent Willie down for the mare, and he telephoned up that McInnis said I could not have her. I asked the reason but there was no reason given. When the mare is there to do my work I consider I am entitled to take her unless some reason is given to keep her in the house, and it was not until after three o'clock Mr. McInnis mentioned oats. All this could have been avoided had Mr. McInnis had a smooth disposition and come to the telephone and explained matters."

## Library of Congress

Now, it appears from the evidence that Mr. McInnis was not there at all at the time that the telephonic conversation was going on. He was up in the field above the Laboratory out of telephonic reach, unless a messenger should be sent to him from the Laboratory telling him to come to the Laboratory telephone. Whether he was there at the time when Mr. McKinnon went to harness Alpha, I do not know, because I have not thought it necessary or advisable to bring Mr. McKinnon into this matter by questioning him at all. I thought it was well, however to ask Mr. McInnis what passed between himself and McKinnon when he visited the stable. He says (p. 10): 8 9 or communication with him whatever since his return until he sent the note to the Point.

7

8 "I had no conversation with McKinnon except telling him I was to use Alpha in the afternoon. Willie's letter will explain that. I didn't know Mr. Davidson wanted to take Alpha that day. I called in the stable on my way to the Laboratory and told Mr. McKinnon as above".

It is perfectly seems evident therefore from this that Mr. Davidson's idea that the Manager was actuated by spite in keeping the horse Alpha from him on that Saturday, when he knew he wanted her — had no foundation in fact, because the Manager didn't know he especially wanted the horse that day, and said nothing whatever about Davidson to McKinnon

I am well aware that Mr. McInnis is not a man to stand irritating language without some reply, and it occurred to me therefore to inquire whether the Manager and Mr. Davidson might not have come in contact with one another before this occurrence, and whether some words might not have passed between them that might have given Mr. Davidson grounds for a feeling of irritation against the Manager. I find, however (p. 11) that Mr. McInnis had no conversation or communication whatever with Mr. Davidson before he sent

## Library of Congress

him the note asking for the horse ( quoted on p. 4. ) I find also that this note was written in courteous terms and could give no just cause of offense to Mr. Davidson.

The general conclusion is that Mr. Davidson's irritation against the Manager in this case on this occasion was utterly unjustified by any act or word of Mr. McInnis.

Not only had Mr. McInnis no conversation with Mr. Davidson upon the day of the occurrence (September 20) but no communication whatever had passed between the two men for more than ten days before this on account of Mr. Davidson's absence from Beinn Bhreagh. He left here for Halifax about the 8th of September — remained away more than a week and Mr. McInnis had held no conversation

8

10 9 This much must be said in justice to Mr. Davidson: — The Manager's instructions — as he understood them — were distinctly offensive, and justified him in feeling aggrieved — but Mr. McInnis personally was not responsible for this.

He did not know that Mr. Davidson wanted the horse that day — and said nothing whatever about him. He simply left word at the stable that he wanted the horse himself — so that Alpha should not be taken away by others. Alpha was liable to be called away for many purposes: — Members of the family might want to drive her — or use her for horseback riding — or Mr. Davidson might want her at the Point. He simply left a notification that the horse was engaged to him for that day, and was not to be used for other purposes.

Of course this meant that “Mr. Davidson could not have her that day”, although the manager did not say so. The misunderstanding arose from supposing that he SAID SO — directly — when it was only an impression implication from his message.

I can readily see how the manager's message could be interpreted — quite innocently — and without intentional mis-representation — into actual the words that proved so

## Library of Congress

were offensive to Mr. Davidson — and I therefore acquit the inter-mediaries (McKinnon and Willie Morrison) of any intentional distortion of the manager's language, and do not care to enquire how the misunderstanding arose. Suffice it to say that there was a misunderstanding. The 9 11 10 manager did not use the words attributed to him and he was therefore blameless in the matter. Mr. Davidson had reason to believe that he did use the words and was therefore justified in feeling a sense of irritation.

Of course this did not justify him Mr. Davidson what he did in doing the very wrong acts that followed — but it should be taken into consideration in judging of his actions. A man in a rage is apt to say and do many things that he will regret in his cooler moments; and I have no doubt that Mr. Davidson, when he knows all the circumstances of the case, will regret his actions as deeply as I do.

He is — like Mr. McInnis — a man of sensitive feelings — easily irritated by anything that seems like injustice towards himself. Both men, however, are characterized by a high sense of honor, and would not willingly do injustice to others. In this matter Mr. Davidson has done injustice to Mr. McInnis — but it has been through ignorance of all the facts in the case — and from a misunderstanding of the nature of the manager's instructions. I blame nobody for this misunderstanding — it was natural under the circumstances. It simply occurred and cannot now be helped. I am in hopes, however, that it may be made the basis of a reconciliation. If Mr. Davidson can be made to realize that he has been unjust to Mr. McInnis, he may be willing to take the first steps towards reapproachment . If Mr. McInnis can be made to realize that Mr. Davidson really had some ground for irritation against him — although he personally was innocent of any offence — he may be willing to meet him half-way.

It would be a great relief to both Mrs. Bell and myself to have these men settle their differences between themselves — 10 12 10 amicably — without resort to me — but of course justice must be done.

## Library of Congress

Mr. Davidson having , through a misunderstanding of the Manager's instructions been put in a very uncomfortable frame of mind — in other words having been made MAD — in more senses than one — proceeded to take the horse he desired — it is admitted both Alpha by force . Now, this upon the face of it, was a very wrong act, and I have sought very earnestly to find what possible justification he could have had for such a proceeding.

He attempts to justify it by claiming that the horse Alpha — had been specially assigned to him for his work. He says (p. 13): —

“When the mare is there to do my work I consider I am entitled to take her unless some reason is given to keep her in the house, and it was not until after 3 o'clock Mr. McInnis mentioned oats”. (Note of September 20 to Mrs. Bell).

Again in his letter to Mrs. Bell dated September 21 (p. 14) he says: —

“About the horse, you know that last fall a horse was to be put aside for my work, had it not been so I would not have been here today, as I know I cannot get along without a horse, and if every horse in the barn had worked as well for their feed as Alpha during the past nine months there would be no loss in keeping horses, and when I send for her I expect to find her in the barn ready for work unless some reason is given — otherwise, if everyone was to take her out to work it would only be a constant trouble.” &c.

In his note to me of September 26 — he asserts that he has a written agreement with us supporting these claims: — (see p. 7).

11

13 12 “I had a letter that a horse was to be put aside for my work and that I was certainly entitled to a reason for ordering her kept in the barn in the morning”, &c., &c., \*\*\*\*\*  
“and if this order is to be carried out regardless of the standing order that now exists in writing and your verbal word to me last fall the result will be no end of trouble about horse”.

## Library of Congress

At my request Mr. Davidson submitted to me the agreement he has in writing concerning this matter, and it turns out to be a note from Mrs. Bell written (Sept. 26, 1901) on the 26th of September, 1901 — in which the following passage occurs: (see p. 8)

“When we are not here one of the horses will be set apart for your special use, when we are here arrangements can be made so that there shall not be so much interference with your work as was the case last summer.”

It thus appears that Mr. Davidson is mistaken in supposing that in that letter or standing order we have had made any promise to set apart a horse for his special use while we are residing here — It refers only to the time when we are not here. — when of course there are spare horses — the members of the family — being absent — not being able to use any horses set apart for driving or riding.

At other times — while we are residing here — the only promise is that we will in regard to other times — the only agreement was that we would try to make arrangements to have less interference with his work than formerly. There is certainly no such agreement I think as could justify him in seizing a horse, and taking it away from the stable in opposition to the express instructions of the manager

This is a case of giving a man an inch and he takes an ell. The manager, acting under our general instructions to accommodate Mr. Davidson with the use of a horse as much as practicable without assigned Alpha assigned has allowed him the use of Alpha but I cannot let him interfere with the other work upon the place — has allowed him to use Alpha to such an extent — even while we are here — that he has looked upon the horse as his own, not to be used by any one else excepting Mrs. Bell and the family, without his permission, and giving him a reason for it.

The accommodation that has been granted to him as a courtesy is now claimed as a right to be enforced even against the manager himself. I have no hesitation in saying that

## Library of Congress

the abduction of Alpha by Mr. Davidson was an outrage deserving of the most severe condemnation. Mr. Davidson I cannot allow that Mr. Davidson a correct in this assumption in that he is not in that he is justified in claiming that Alpha or any other horse has been specially assigned to his work while we are here . Alpha is not his horse in any sense of the term excepting by the permission of the manager — who is of course the supreme authority on this place under Mrs. Bell and myself. The manager's authority must be respected and we will support him in all proper exercise of it . While Mr. McInnis had the right to direct how Alpha should be employed without assigning any reason for it — he did, as a matter of fact, assign a reason to Mr. Davidson in the only communication he addressed to him upon the subject (p. 4). He wanted the horse “to take in oats”. Mr. Davidson knew that it was late Saturday afternoon “after 3 o'clock” and that the oats would have to lie out in the field over Sunday if not taken in then — yet he refused curtly and disrespectfully and only sent the horse down — at Mrs. Bell's request — too late for effective work, to give w/o the horse repudiating altogether the authority of the manager in the matter. Such conduct cannot be tolerated permitted upon the place and Mr. McInnis was justified in bringing the matter 13 to my attention.

I have tried to be fair to both sides and to put myself in the place of both men — but cannot find any real justification for the conduct of Mr. Davidson. On the other hand I cannot find anything to blame in Mr. McInnis conduct of this matter — no except that running how much Mr Davidson used Alpha have sent and whom that he was required that day for my work. not in the smallest degree.

He might be criticized for using the carriage horses for farm work without the permission of Mrs. Bell or myself who might be inconvenienced thereby — if we wished to drive. Well, I find that he did consult Mrs. Bell upon the subject — and that it was by her permission that Dewey and Alpha were assigned to farm work and that the farm horses were used for breaking in the ground at the wind break. But again, a captious critic might object to his interfering with the usual work upon the place by putting men and horses on an outside job at the laboratory. Why did he not let out the job to outsiders by contract instead of

## Library of Congress

interrupting necessary work upon the place? Well, I find that he did try to get men and horses from outside — but found everyone so busy with their farming operations — that they could not undertake the work. He reported this to Mrs. Bell — and it was by her direction and solicitation that he used the men and horses upon the place.

So far as appears from the evidence.

but that would be a matter of courtesy with obligation or he might have arranged to place another horse at Mr. Davidson disposal — & this is the only point on which I think he could properly be criticized.

Part III THE DE CISION Letter to Mr. McInnis Oct. 3 1902 Copy to be sent to MR. Davidson.

### **Part III — T he Dec isi on Submitted for Mabel's approval. Agb**

Beinn Bhreagh. Victoria County. Cape Breton, N.S. October 3, 1902. Mr. Angus McInnis, Manager of Beinn Bhreagh. Dear Mr. McInnis: —

In accordance with your request I have examined into the Davidson matter, and am glad that you brought it to my attention, because it is really a very serious matter that your authority as our Manager should have been impugned and yourself insulted. The fact that you did not instantly discharge Mr. Davidson, but referred the matter to me, shows how anxious you are to do right and be just to all concerned. In the whole matter you seem to me to have acted with great propriety and judgment, and with great forbearance under irritating circumstances.

I have taken a great deal of trouble to get at the true facts of the case in order to do justice to both sides, and I have come to the conclusion that Mr. Davidson's conduct was thoroughly reprehensible, and that you would be justified in discharging him from the place, or requesting his resignation.

## Library of Congress

On the other hand, I find that Mr. Davidson was suffering under a misapprehension as to his rights to the horse Alpha. He claimed that Alpha had been specially assigned to him for his work, so that he considered he was entitled to take her when she was not wanted by Mrs. Bell and the family for driving. He stated that he had a standing order to this effect in writing, and I asked 2 Mr. McInnis him to show it to me. I find it was contained in a note from Mrs. Bell written last year, (September 26, 1901), and reads as follows: —

“When we are not here one of the horses will be set apart for your special use, when we are here arrangements can be made so that there shall not be so much interference with your work as was the case last summer.”

It thus appears that Mr. Davidson is mistaken in supposing that in that letter or standing order we had made any promise to set apart a horse for his special use while we are residing here — it refers only to the time when we are NOT here. In regard to other times, the only agreement was that we would try to make arrangements to have less interference with his work than formerly. While there is nothing in the above agreement that could justify him in seizing a horse, and taking it away from the stable in opposition to the express instructions of the Manager, I have no doubt that he was honestly laboring under a misapprehension of his rights in the matter.

I also find that Mr. Davidson was laboring under a misapprehension as to the nature of your instructions to Mr. McKinnon relating to Alpha. I suspected this from the first, when he told me — that Willie Morrison told him — that Mr. McKinnon told Willie Morrison — that Mr. McInnis told Mr. McKinnon — that “Davidson would not get the horse to the Point that day”, &c.

“A chain is no stronger than its weakest link”; and it is 3 never safe to rely upon the accuracy of statements passed from mouth to mouth in this way. They nearly always get twisted in transit. Mr. Davidson gained the impression that you knew he wanted Alpha — had stopped the harnessing of the mare for him — had ordered the horse to be kept in the

## Library of Congress

barn stating that “Davidson should not get the mare that day” — had assigned no reason — and had made no arrangements to supply Mr. Davidson with another horse, although you knew that there were other horses on the place not doing work. Of course there was no real foundation for these statements because you did not know that Mr. Davidson wanted Alpha at all that day, and you merely called in at the stable on your way to the laboratory and told Mr. McKinnon that you wanted Dewey and Alpha in the afternoon.

Now, while the above facts do not by any means justify Mr. Davidson's conduct, they serve to show that he thought he had a real grievance, and I think this should be taken into consideration in judging of his acts.

Another thing worthy of notice, I think, is this: — That the reason why Mr. Davidson wanted the horse sprang from a desire to do his work well and please Mrs. Bell. Mrs. Bell had asked him why he had not had the grass mowed. He determined, therefore, to have it mowed as soon as possible, but he couldn't do this without a horse, and sent for Alpha.

4

The disagreeable incidents of Saturday, September 20, can thus be traced to a desire upon Mr. Davidson's part to do his work well — to a misapprehension of his right to the use of a horse — and to a misunderstanding of the nature of the instructions that stood in the way of his getting Alpha. One thing led to another — regrettable actions and words followed quickly upon the heels of each other — and the whole affair culminated naturally in the EXPLOSION of Saturday evening.

Now, the question arises: — What should you do under the circumstances? I understand that you wish to consult me upon this point.

I think it would be best for you to try and settle this matter amicably; for if Mr. Davidson resigns now — or is discharged — a stain would rest upon his character. He is undoubtedly a good man, and a good worker, and sincerely devoted to our interests; and

## Library of Congress

when he leaves our employment we would like to be able to say that he has served us faithfully and well, and that we have nothing against him.

I must insist, however, that if he is to remain, Mr. Davidson must render you a sufficient and satisfactory apology in writing — for the authority of our Manager must be upheld upon this place.

I enclose a copy of this letter to Mr. Davidson for his information.

Yours sincerely, Alexander Graham Bell